

The International Competition for Urban Design and Harmony of Ramses Square

Jury Decision

On Sunday, 5th of September, 2009, all the Jury members of "The International Competition for Urban Design and Harmony of Ramses Square" have held a meeting at "Ofouk" hall to evaluate the 35 entries to the competition.

Jury members:

- 1-Prof. Dr. Abdallah Abdel Aziz (President)
(Egypt)
- 2-Prof. Dr. Abdel Mohsen Barada (Jury Member)
(Egypt)
- 3-Prof. Dr. Sameh El-Alaily *J. N. W. R.* (Jury Member)
(Egypt)
- 4-Mr. Alexandru Beldiman (UIA Representative)
(Jury Member) (Romania)
- 5-Prof. Diana Agrest (Jury Member)
(USA)
- 6-Mr. Axel Schultes (Jury Member)
(Germany)
- 7-Mr. Eliseo Arredondo (Jury Member)
(Mexico)
- 8-Prof. Claire Bailly (Deputy Member)
(France)
- 9-Prof. Dr. Soheir Zaki Hawas (Deputy Member)
(Egypt)

Soheir Zaki Hawas
Agrest

Barada

A. F. Alla



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

The jury started by listening to a presentation by Dr. S. Hawas -head of the technical committee- which covered three subjects:

- Statement about the number of entries to the competition
- A review of the competition scope of work , emphasizing its objectives and the 5 evaluation criteria stated in it, namely the following:
 - Solving the traffic problem (with reference to central Cairo
 - Innovation
 - Urban design of the square
 - Addressing the pedestrian requirements
 - The feasibility of the proposal
- The preparatory analysis of the projects prepared by the technical committee, which was put in the form of two sheets for each entry -Describing the main features of each entry and its degree satisfaction of the required submittals.

The jury has disqualified two projects for not submitting the sheets (boards) required and have submitted only C.D.s

These are projects coded: **B1414 Z** and **R 2201 P**
Thus the number of remaining projects became 33.

After a first round through the projects, examining them and viewing the videos (the DVDs presented by the competitors), the jury have excluded 21 projects (after individual and separate voting) as the entries didn't satisfy most of the objectives of the competition.

Barade

alia



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

During the second round, on Monday 6th of September, the remaining 13 projects were examined carefully and each was discussed by all members of the jury together.

The jury has voted to eliminate 8 projects at this stage. These are projects that did not address itself to at least three of the main issues stated as objectives of the competition, despite the fact that some of the projects have some ideas and useful proposals.

On Tuesday 8th of September, 2009, the jury members examined the remaining five projects. The Jury asked traffic consultants Prof. Dr. Rashad El-Metiny and Prof. Dr. Laila Radwan to join the meeting to clarify some aspects of the existing conditions of the area specifically the levels of metro station and lines as well as the feasibility of some of the traffic proposals made by some competitors.

The jury noted at this stage that each project had both positive and negative aspects. The jury scored the levels in which each project addressed the main issues of the competition.

After a comprehensive discussion the jury decided to vote on the five remaining projects.

The Result is:

- 1- The highest score for Entry with code number: B 1304 E (33 pts)
- 2- Second Prize to Entry with code number: K 0704 B (23 pts)
- 3- Third Prize to Entry with code number: I 0114 P (17 pts)

The other two projects have scored 16 points each.

Banade



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

The jury have made the following comments, on the three winning projects which to be taken in consideration while developing the final project:

First Prize:

B 1304 E

Project details:

This project creates a true urban plaza.

Some of the qualities of this project are:

- *Diverting 6th October flyover section located between two interchanges into a 1.5 km tunnel under the square*
- *Leaving the square free of traffic, making the metro station and its access a genuine public pedestrian space.*
- *Modifying Ramses street in a two-way route between two interchanges.*
- *Transforming "Kobry Laymoon" bridge into a pedestrian route.*

Submerging the "6th of October" Flyover under the new Ramses Square offers a major improvement liberating urban space and integrating the adjacent neighborhood to the South adding landscape to the North of the Station will also help from an environmental point of view.

The proposed concept for the area to the East of the station between Ramses Street and Ahmed Helmy area offers an important contribution to the area. The addition of new cultural institutions and activities in a context of green is essential to invigorate the area creating a new node of attraction in the city while at the same time it offers a controlled park.

One important aspect of this project is the emphasis on the importance of public transportation and thus the inclusion of a higher rail system.

4 J. weller

Allea

Banada

AB



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

However; Traffic problem are not sufficiently addressed, it requires major restudy especially in the following:

- Study the feasibility of the proposed Ramses Tunnel in its relation to the levels of the metro station and lines also comparing that proposal with the rerouting of the flyover and its economic and urban viability.
- Local surface traffic has not been addressed in a satisfactory manner especially traffic from North to South.
- Entrance and exits to underground garages need further study
- Differentiation between pedestrian and traffic roads should be clarified.

Second prize:

K0704 P

Project details:

In spite of its simple presentation and elaboration it has clear, simple and largely feasible proposals.

A clearly confined public space for Ramses Square, at least the front of the station itself and the new alignment of buildings opposite and an enlarged urban pedestrian space – a feature that is unique among all the entries of the competition – rare quality of the proposals. Ramses Street is covered with a lifted part of the square. These terraces bring all the desired peace and freedom from traffic noise, hustle and pollution to the public, vastly crowded, realm for the tens of thousands pedestrians.

As with almost all the other entries, problems of individual car traffic poses questions not answered to the



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

full, especially the tunnel of Ramses street needs to be restudied in terms of level and routing as it would intersect the metro and would be impossible to realize. The jury did not put much emphasis on this crucial "issue", because the route of this covered street could be modified to address this issue.

Third prize

I 0114 P

Project details:

This project is based on:

- Transforming the square into a pedestrian plaza.
- Linking the proposed route for the 6th October flyover and the extension of North Gamalya Axis through four exits.
- Transforming the route of the flyover behind the Station, Ahmed Helmy Square.
- Three parks in front of Ramses Building, Al-Fath Mosque and the approach to Kamel Sedky Street.
- Changing a section of Al-Galaa Street to a pedestrian route.
- Two sub-squares, the first is Ahmed Helmy Square (residential commercial zone) and the second is the railway yards, multiuse buildings.

Comments:

- The project did not solve the traffic problem.
- The pedestrian public space area is divided in two parts, which does not favour movement and visual perception.
- This is a very strong proposition with a very well defined square which is separated from the surrounding streets by an open structure that acts as

Banada



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

- a filter between the pedestrians and the movement of traffic while not obstructing views.
- The square itself has been carefully treated integrating hard surface with green and a substantial water fountain.
 - To the East and connected to the Square by a green street, the project proposed a residential development where fabric and green are integrated.
 - These were doubts about the possible "wall" effect of the open structure surrounding the Square.

J. N. R.

Banada

Al. A. Alia



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

**The International Competition for Urban
Design and Harmony of Ramses Square**

Jury decision:

First Prize to Entry with code number : B 1304 E
Second Prize to Entry with code number : K 0704 B
Third Prize to Entry with code number : I 0114 P

The Jury members are:

- 1-Prof. Abdullah Abdel Aziz (President)
.....*B. A. Aziz*.....
- 2-Prof. Abdel Mohsen Barada (Jury Member)
.....*A. Barada*.....
- 3-Prof. Sameh El-Alaily (Jury Member)
.....*S. El-Alaily*.....
- 4-Mr. Alexandru Beldiman (Jury Member)
.....*A. Beldiman*.....
- 5-Ms. Diana Agrest (Jury Member)
.....*D. Agrest*.....
- 6-Mr. Axel Schultes (Jury Member)
.....*A. Schultes*.....
- 7-Mr. Eliseo Arredondo (Jury Member)
.....*E. Arredondo*.....



THE NATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR URBAN HARMONY
NOUH

**The International Competition for Urban
Design and Harmony of Ramses Square**

**Disclosure of the identity of the competition three
winners**

Following the signature of the Jury Decision and Report and in attendance of the jury members and members of the technical committee Secretariat who were entrusted for coding the entries (Prof. Hala Mekawy – Rasha Mahgoub), the identity of the three winning projects were disclosed as follows:

1- First Prize with code number: B 1304 E

The entry belongs to: Group AREP / BECT represented by Prof. Arch. Omar El-Hosseiny (France – Egypt)

2- Second Prize to Entry with code number: K 0704 B

The entry belongs to: Quilligan Architects represented by Paul Gerard Quilligan (Ireland)

3- Third Prize to Entry with code number: I 0114 P

The entry belongs to: Nimet Aydin (Turkey)

Attendants:

1- Prof. Abdullah Abdel Aziz

2- Prof. Abdel Mohsen Barada

3- Prof. Sameh El-Alaily

4- Mr. Alexandru Beldiman

5- Prof. Diana Agrest

6- Mr. Eliseo Arredondo

7- Prof. Claire Bailly

8- Prof. Soheir Zaki Hawas

9- Prof. Hala Mekawy

10- Rasha Mahgoub

O. A. Allca

A. Barada

Sameh El-Alaily

Alexandru Beldiman

Diana Agrest

Eliseo Arredondo

Claire Bailly

Soheir Zaki Hawas

Hala Mekawy

Rasha Mahgoub